

1-1-2013

Book Review: The Eternal Generation of the Son: Maintaining Orthodoxy in Trinitarian Theology. By Kevin Giles

Nancy Dallavalle

Fairfield University, ndallavalle@fairfield.edu

Copyright 2013 Theological Studies
Archived here with permission from the copyright holder.

Repository Citation

Dallavalle, Nancy, "Book Review: The Eternal Generation of the Son: Maintaining Orthodoxy in Trinitarian Theology. By Kevin Giles" (2013). *Religious Studies Faculty Publications*. Paper 100.
<http://digitalcommons.fairfield.edu/religiousstudies-facultypubs/100>

Published Citation

Dallavalle, N. Book Review: The Eternal Generation of the Son: Maintaining Orthodoxy in Trinitarian Theology. By Kevin Giles. In *Theological Studies*, 74(3) 2013, pp. 738-740

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Religious Studies Department at DigitalCommons@Fairfield. It has been accepted for inclusion in Religious Studies Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@Fairfield. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@fairfield.edu.

lead beyond what remains even today the official teaching of the Church's magisterium." But he quickly adds that he is referring to a vision still "deeply anchored in the Church's living tradition" and is building upon it. For this, in turn, free inquiry is permitted and indeed necessarily encouraged, since "the official doctrine of the Church does not claim to fix boundaries beyond which theological research is forbidden to venture," but only "to draw guidelines and to indicate pointers along which theology may think and reflect anew, in the present context, on the ineffable divine mystery, which has been progressively disclosed to humankind throughout history and, 'in these last days,' 'fully revealed' in Jesus Christ." In the end D. states very clearly, "I once more submit my endeavors to the consideration of my theological peers and to the judgment of the Church's doctrinal authority" (100–101). This was an act of humility, but one that also begged for a response in kind from church authorities. Sadly, D.'s two weighty responses received no further reaction from his official critics.

Clear, well put together, and relatively brief, this book will be a valuable resource in advanced undergraduate or graduate courses, as well as to the scholar of Catholic theology and polity since the council. B. is to be thanked for his work in retrieving and filling out the record.

Harvard University, Cambridge, MA

FRANCIS X. CLOONEY, S.J.

THE ETERNAL GENERATION OF THE SON: MAINTAINING ORTHODOXY IN TRINITARIAN THEOLOGY. By Kevin Giles. Foreword by Robert Letham. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2012. Pp. 270. \$24.

Giles is an Anglican minister with considerable parish experience whose scholarly work has consistently engaged with questions about women in ministry. The evangelical form of Christianity to which he is committed has a lengthy tradition of conversation about the role of Scripture and its relation to church tradition. In our own day, that requires a fresh consideration of the creation of humanity as male and female, the role of each in human societies and their structure, and the theological significance that sexual difference is said to have. This book, therefore, is a constructive extension of his earlier *The Trinity and Subordination: The Doctrine of God and the Contemporary Gender Debate* (2002), in which he argues against evangelical writers who claim that the Son's subordination to the Father warrants the structural subordination of women to men.

G.'s goal in this book is to assert that the belief in the eternal generation of the Son has "biblical warrant," which he grounds in the community of belief and the "overall teaching of Scripture" (57, 63, 246), an approach that is clearly at odds with some of his evangelical audience. This study, therefore, is as much about G.'s understanding of orthodoxy

as requiring both Scripture and the tradition of faith, as it is about trinitarian doctrine.

Indeed, chapter 2's exposition of Giles's understanding of what it means to "do" evangelical theology is an interesting and constructive contribution in the context of this specific question, as it pushes back against the pressure of contemporary evangelical theologians who want to change the creed by eliminating five words: "eternally begotten of the Father." G. seeks to articulate the robust support for the creedal language in the doctrinal controversies of the early church—a focus that also, subsequently, requires an examination of the notion of the monarchy (both *monarchia* and *monarchie*) of the Father, particularly in the Cappadocians.

G. reads the theological tradition against the views of those like Wayne Grudem, finding Grudem's notion that the eternal generation of the Son also means that the Son is eternally subordinate in authority to be "profoundly perverse" (212), a genuine distortion of the tradition's decisive rejection of Arianism. Inner chapters of this study move quickly through Augustine and Aquinas, but then helpfully touch on a variety of Reformation and post-Reformation figures, lending each a sketch of context and building his argument that the teaching on the eternal generation of the Son has been present throughout Christian history.

Taking contemporary theological reflection as a whole, G. is struck by how infrequently this question is engaged by theologians. Thomas Torrance is a notable exception to this observation. According to G., he supplies an important argument in his claim that the being of the first Person, rather than its personal distinction, is the source of the divine Persons; thus God is "relatively" and not "absolutely" "Father." Torrance's approach, G. notes, paved the way for the important 1991 articulation of the *filioque* that proved acceptable to both Orthodox and Reformed churches.

It is clear, as G. observes in his earlier work on Trinity and gender, that the recent move to reject the ancient notion of the Son's eternal generation is likely to be used to shore up theological and ecclesial support for patriarchal gender norms. Yet, in this study G. avoids this connection as a point of focus, limiting himself to the immediate point that, for those associated with what he calls the "Grudem-Ware doctrine," the eternal subordination of the Son means that the second Person of the Trinity is eternally "subordinate in authority" to the Father. Thus, for these "complementarians," the Trinity reveals that, with the "monarchy of the Father," a hierarchy of headship and subordination is the way God is and—less explored here—the way we should be.

This study is marked by clarity of exposition and thorough footnotes, making it a valuable addition to the "recommended" list for any graduate course in the doctrine of God. While the arguments draw upon evangelical

theological commitments, students of the Catholic tradition would certainly benefit from its perspective on the discussion of God's triunity.

Fairfield University, CT

NANCY DALLAVALLE

L'ALBA DELL'UNITÀ: IN DIALOGO CON J.-M. R. TILLARD. By Riccardo Bollati. Rome: Città nuova, 2012. Pp. 536. \$54.14.

Bollati, a Roman Catholic priest and research assistant at the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, has written a comprehensive study of the theology of Jean-Marie Roger Tillard, the late Dominican theologian and ecumenist. While pointing out what he considers the "shadows" of Tillard's methodology and theological positions, B. is a perceptive and appreciative reader of Tillard. The book will be of service to theologians in evaluating and building on Tillard's ecclesiology of communion.

The study consists of a thorough exposition of Tillard's ecclesiology, followed by a critical analysis of it. The descriptive half of the book is impressive in its thoroughness: in 250 pages, B. provides chapter-by-chapter synopses of each of Tillard's books, followed by broader summaries. Given his critiques of Tillard, these synopses are notably attentive to detail and objective. The ordering of this treatment is somewhat troublesome: to provide a "systematic" overview of Tillard, a sometimes less than systematic thinker, B. discusses the books in a topical rather than chronological order. This is the opposite approach of other Tillard scholarship, such as that of Pascale Watine Christory, which traces the development of Tillard's thought within his ecumenical contexts. B. reads Tillard independently of this context and chronology. This choice allows him to present Tillard's thought as a unified whole, moving from Eucharist, through basic ecclesiology, to the papacy. Nevertheless, as he recognizes in some places, Tillard's thought is resistant to this approach, and he has some difficulty addressing development in Tillard's theology.

In the second part, comprising an additional 200 pages of substantive analysis, B. presents what he considers the "lights and shadows" of Tillard's ecclesiology. In the former category, he places the origins of Tillard's thought in the Scriptures, the Fathers, and the Eucharist. He commends Tillard's ecumenical perspective, as well as his promotion of locality as a fundamental category for ecclesiology. Finally, despite his concerns, B.'s appreciative presentation of so much of Tillard's work is, in itself, an argument for its value and consonant with B.'s concluding judgment of Tillard's thought as "fundamentally Catholic" (494).

B.'s significant criticisms are helpful in understanding Tillard better and in clearly distinguishing his thought from other ecclesiologies. Although B. raises perceptive questions regarding Tillard's methodology,