

6-1-1989

"The Reign of Conscience: Individual, Church and State in Lord Acton's History of Liberty by John Nurser"

Jeffrey P. von Arx S.J.

Fairfield University, president@fairfield.edu

Copyright 1989 Theological Studies (<http://www.ts.mu.edu/>)

Peer Reviewed

Repository Citation

von Arx, Jeffrey P. S.J., ""The Reign of Conscience: Individual, Church and State in Lord Acton's History of Liberty by John Nurser"" (1989). *History Faculty Publications*. 19.
<http://digitalcommons.fairfield.edu/history-facultypubs/19>

Published Citation

von Arx S.J., Jeffrey P., Book Review: "The Reign of Conscience: Individual, Church and State in Lord Acton's History of Liberty by John Nurser" *Theological Studies* 50 no 2 Je 1989, p 400-401. <http://www.ts.mu.edu/>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the History Department at DigitalCommons@Fairfield. It has been accepted for inclusion in History Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@Fairfield. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@fairfield.edu.

faceted mysticism, treating in order its Trinitarian, Christological, and ecclesial dimensions, and the aspect of service it involves. Two concluding chapters deal with questions of Ignatius' own extraordinary experience and offer us a genuine spiritual portrait of the man himself.

In clear and concise language E. brings light to an often perplexing subject. Each section of his work is well documented and reveals his mastery of the entire Ignatian corpus. He has dug deeply into the sources for a thorough understanding of Ignatius' mystical development and has emerged with a picture of Ignatius which is compelling and often brilliant. The chapters entitled "A Trinitarian Mysticism" and "An Ecclesial Mysticism of Discernment" are of special interest. They follow the lines of E.'s earlier work on Ignatius and illuminate two of the more difficult facets of the subject. An excellent introduction to Ignatian mysticism for beginners, this work contains fresh insights for more advanced students as well.

FRANK J. HOUDEK, S.J.

Jesuit School of Theology, Berkeley

WILLIAM PORCHER DUBOSE: SELECTED WRITINGS. Edited by John Alexander, O.P. New York: Paulist, 1988. Pp. viii + 314. \$19.95.

Sydney Ahlstrom has called the Episcopalian William Porcher DuBose (1836-1918) "one of the most profound American theologians of the [post-Civil War] period . . . , almost a living stereotype of 'classic' Southern upbringing, [whose] combination of evangelical fervor and Anglo-Catholic modernism . . . has been almost completely unappreciated in America even by his fellow Episcopalian." An exception was DuB.'s disciple, and briefly his colleague at the University of the South in Sewanee, Tennessee, William Thomas Manning, Episcopalian bishop of New York from 1921 to 1946, who

called DuB. "an apostle of reality, [confident] that truth can be trusted to vindicate itself to those who truly seek it."

Conceding the difficulty of his subject's thought, due in good part to its "spiral rather than linear" character (reminiscent of John Henry Newman), Alexander writes that "DuB.'s life was the principal source of his theology." "I have always spoken from myself, but I have never spoken of myself," DuB. told a reunion of his former students in 1911. Referring to "God's coming to me" in a conversion experience at age 18, DuB. said that "in finding Him I found myself: a man's own self, when he has once truly come to himself, is his best and only experimental proof of God."

Through a fine sketch of DuB.'s life, an analysis of his thought, and selections from his writings, this almost forgotten figure lives again. The book is a valuable contribution to the history of American religious thought.

JOHN JAY HUGHES

*Immaculate Conception Church
Arnold, Mo.*

THE REIGN OF CONSCIENCE: INDIVIDUAL, CHURCH AND STATE IN LORD ACTON'S HISTORY OF LIBERTY. By John Nurser. New York: Garland, 1987. Pp. 220. \$40.

Lord Acton's long planned, never published *History of Liberty* was once called the "greatest history never written," and Acton's reputation as a Victorian man of letters never quite recovered from that malicious *bon mot*. Nurser's purpose in the present work is to offer grounds for thinking that Acton made a distinctive contribution to 19th-century historiography. This purpose N. accomplishes by attempting a reconstruction of the *History of Liberty* on the basis of Acton's voluminous notes for the project now housed in the Cambridge University Library.

This is a worthwhile project on its

own merits. Intellectual historians have had some idea of what Acton might have intended from fragments of the *History* that were published, but have wondered about the shape of the whole. N. provides a convincing account of what that whole would have looked like. He does this, however, at a price. Since the evidence for his interpretation is primarily Acton's note cards, N. builds his case by citing the repetition of themes on card after card. This makes the book rather hard going.

Readers of *TS* will find N.'s discoveries about Acton of interest in light of present discussion on the nature of liberalism. N. makes it quite clear, e.g., that Acton understood liberalism as public philosophy to be the necessary and inevitable outcome of the development of the religious idea of conscience, not of the secular idea of individual rights.

Even insofar as N. is successful in vindicating Acton as one of the great historical system builders of the 19th century, he only serves to remind us how much out of sympathy we are with that whole project. Reading Acton today, especially his notes, is seeing the philosophic mind, armed with the blunt weapon of a priori thinking, run amok among the complexities and ambiguities of human history. It is not a pretty sight.

JEFFREY VON ARX, S.J.
Georgetown University

A REVOLUTION OF THE HEART: ESSAYS ON THE CATHOLIC WORKER. Edited by Patrick G. Coy. Philadelphia: Temple University, 1988. Pp. xiv + 388. \$29.95.

On May 1, 1933, on the streets of New York City, a ragtag group gave away the first copies of a new radical Christian newspaper, the *Catholic Worker*. The first issues were produced by two nonviolent revolutionaries, Peter Maurin and Dorothy Day, who had been sheltering the homeless and feed-

ing the poor. Those early Catholic Worker activities have today blossomed into over 90 houses around the country and a host of newspapers. The movement has revolutionized the American Catholic Church, becoming the Church's conscience, a voice for the poor and for peacemakers.

Since Day's death in 1980, several works have delved into CW history; perhaps the most significant is *By Little and Little: The Selected Writings of Dorothy Day*, edited by Robert Ellsberg. Now a new collection of essays has appeared, a thorough scholarly study of the people and the history of the movement and its rich themes of voluntary poverty, gospel nonviolence, and solidarity with the poor. It is the most vigorous and rigorous examination of the CW experiment to appear in print, and significantly it originated within the movement itself.

Coy, from the CW house in St. Louis, introduces the collection as "a forum for both the scholar and the worker," a contribution toward Maurin's dream of regular round-table discussions "for clarification of thought and action." The book begins with a series of essays on the lives and philosophies of cofounders Maurin and Day, as well as a chapter on the famous pacifist Ammon Hennacy (one of the liveliest and most challenging of the essays). Part 2 examines themes of free obedience, spirituality, practicing nonviolence among the poor, and the antiwar movements of the Berrigan brothers, all in the CW context. O'Gorman and Coy's essay on dealing with violent guests at the houses of hospitality is insightful and helpful for those who serve Christ in the homeless. Part 3 presents two case histories: the beginnings of the CW in St. Louis and Chicago.

The work is well researched; scholars such as Eileen Egan, Nancy Roberts, and Mel Piehl are among the many competent contributors. The essays provide a positive analysis of the most