

1-1-2003

Book review: Advents of the Spirit: An Introduction to the Current Study of Pneumatology. Edited by Bradford E. Hinze and D. Lyle Dabney

Nancy Dallavalle

Fairfield University, ndallavalle@fairfield.edu

Copyright 2003 Theological Studies

Peer Reviewed

Repository Citation

Dallavalle, Nancy, "Book review: Advents of the Spirit: An Introduction to the Current Study of Pneumatology. Edited by Bradford E. Hinze and D. Lyle Dabney" (2003). *Religious Studies Faculty Publications*. 86.
<http://digitalcommons.fairfield.edu/religiousstudies-facultypubs/86>

Published Citation

Dallavalle, Nancy. (2003). Book review: Advents of the Spirit: An Introduction to the Current Study of Pneumatology. Edited by Bradford E. Hinze and D. Lyle Dabney. In *Theological Studies* 64 (3), pp. 635-636.

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Religious Studies Department at DigitalCommons@Fairfield. It has been accepted for inclusion in Religious Studies Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@Fairfield. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@fairfield.edu.

It is not surprising that bringing the social model of the Trinity to bear on anthropology results in a focus on relationality, both human and divine. What is interesting and thought-provoking in G.'s work is the distinctly eschatological and ecclesiological perspective that he brings to the concept of *imago Dei*. Indeed he argues that the image of God is ultimately an eschatological concept—it is our divinely given human calling and our divine destiny—and as such has crucial implications for Christian thought and practice, and particularly for our understanding of the nature and role of the Church.

G. brings a vast array of resources—from theology, exegesis, psychology, and philosophy—to this impressive and useful study. Attention to the medieval theological contribution, however, is relatively slight, and exploration of contemporary approaches to the psychological analogy, such as those offered by Karl Rahner and Bernard Lonergan, would have further enriched the study. A bibliography, rather than just footnotes, would also have been helpful.

Australian Catholic University, Ballarat, Vic.

ANNE HUNT

ADVENTS OF THE SPIRIT: AN INTRODUCTION TO THE CURRENT STUDY OF PNEUMATOLOGY. Edited by Bradford E. Hinze and D. Lyle Dabney. Marquette Studies in Theology, 30. Milwaukee: Marquette University, 2001. Pp. 484. \$45.

This collection represents the fruit of a 1998 meeting at Marquette University that brought together an impressive group of scholars to discuss “the current state of research into Pneumatology” (11). Biblical, historical, and philosophical resources are interrogated first, followed by chapters on current theological questions in the discipline of Pneumatology, the intersection of Spirit Christology and Trinity, and the role of the Spirit in ecclesiology and practical theology. Overall, the volume is organized according to the meeting’s seminar format of papers and responses.

In the earlier part of the collection, Philip Clayton builds a strong case for a panentheistic account of the God/world relation that is adequate to “the idea ‘in’ human consciousness of an Infinite Ground ‘in’ which consciousness itself lives and moves and has its being” (197). Clayton’s philosophical approach requires a careful and conscious embrace of the anthropomorphism that characterizes theological language. Still to be clarified is how this understanding of Spirit, while dynamic and relational, is fully trinitarian. Elizabeth Dreyer’s retrieval of medieval sources would be a good conversation partner here, particularly her work on Catherine of Siena.

Essays by Lyle Dabney and Bradford Hinze are particularly good examples of the “state of the question” model, both of which represent promising avenues for future work. Dabney’s constructive “theology of the third article” takes as its starting point not the monarchial Father or the

God-with-us Son, but an inductive “emergent ‘common’ ” (254). Hinze’s survey of the role Pneumatology has played in recent ecclesiology paves the way for his analysis of current discussions about catholicity, communion and identity, and communicative action. In a complementary fashion, Jürgen Moltmann and David Coffey’s essays on the question of “Spirit Christology” represent well-developed positions on the trinitarian basis for the person of the Spirit, sharpened by respondent Ralph Del Colle’s careful delineation of the question of the Spirit in the taxis of the economy.

Questions arise as Anselm Kyongsuk Min puts forward the model of solidarity rather than communion, so as to highlight his practical and ethical claim that theology should be done by “Others *together*” rather than “*with* Others.” The gains of serving these claims, however, seem to come at the price of a problematic anthropomorphism, as Min, recognizing that we cannot allow the common notion of “person” to confine revelation, calls us to “stretch our notion of person to fit the theological data” (433). A similar tendency is found as Min notes the “sexism” of traditional language about God, but continues it, arguing that using the feminine pronoun for the Holy Spirit “balances” the masculine and feminine references. It does not.

That such an ambitious undertaking would have omissions is understandable. Nonetheless, omissions are worth noting as they provide a sense of the discipline’s current self-understanding. The editors lament the lack of the voices of feminism, Orthodox theology, and Pentecostal Christianity, but these voices offer claims that should not be compartmentalized. For example, the symposium was not only lacking an explicitly feminist critique but consistently sidestepped the obvious gender models that underscore accepted treatments of “persons” and “relations” and “Father and Son,” terms that appear in almost every essay. Indeed, Nancy Victorin-Vangerud warns of romanticizing familial metaphors in the easy embrace of Trinitarian *communio*. Michael Fahey’s response adds the important concern that Pneumatology not be considered apart from liturgical theology and, most importantly, the recent ecumenical work of the World Council of Churches.

As presented, the collection reads somewhat more as a “proceedings” volume than the introduction to “the state of the question” advertised. The responses are often directed more to the essays’ authors than to the texts themselves. While readers familiar with the terrain will fill in the subtext, others will find some of the responses overly schematic. For example, responses to William Tabbernee’s careful reexamination of the characteristics attributed to Montanism and Dreyer’s richly textured retrieval of medieval images for the Spirit seem to be less than fully realized (Frederick Norris on Tabbernee) or not directly a “response” (Wanda Zemler-Cizewski on Dreyer). But these minor concerns are offset by the range and depth of the material presented in this collection, a collection that will be of value to systematic theologians across the board and will likely appear on the syllabus of every graduate course on the topic of the Holy Spirit.



Copyright and Use:

As an ATLAS user, you may print, download, or send articles for individual use according to fair use as defined by U.S. and international copyright law and as otherwise authorized under your respective ATLAS subscriber agreement.

No content may be copied or emailed to multiple sites or publicly posted without the copyright holder(s)' express written permission. Any use, decompiling, reproduction, or distribution of this journal in excess of fair use provisions may be a violation of copyright law.

This journal is made available to you through the ATLAS collection with permission from the copyright holder(s). The copyright holder for an entire issue of a journal typically is the journal owner, who also may own the copyright in each article. However, for certain articles, the author of the article may maintain the copyright in the article. Please contact the copyright holder(s) to request permission to use an article or specific work for any use not covered by the fair use provisions of the copyright laws or covered by your respective ATLAS subscriber agreement. For information regarding the copyright holder(s), please refer to the copyright information in the journal, if available, or contact ATLA to request contact information for the copyright holder(s).

About ATLAS:

The ATLA Serials (ATLAS®) collection contains electronic versions of previously published religion and theology journals reproduced with permission. The ATLAS collection is owned and managed by the American Theological Library Association (ATLA) and received initial funding from Lilly Endowment Inc.

The design and final form of this electronic document is the property of the American Theological Library Association.